



Division of Materials and Waste Management Response to Comments

Carbon Limestone Landfill Permit to Install Phase II and III Lateral and Vertical Expansion PTI Application Number 02-22816

Agency Contacts for this Project

Division Contact: Allison Giancola, DMWM, (330) 963-1132,
Allison.Giancola@epa.ohio.gov

Public Involvement Coordinator: Kristopher Weiss, (614) 644-2160
Kristopher.Weiss@epa.ohio.gov

Ohio EPA held a public hearing along with a public information session on Nov. 15, 2012 regarding a draft permit-to-install (PTI) for lateral and vertical expansion of the Carbon Limestone Landfill located in Mahoning County. This document summarizes the comments and questions received at the public hearing and during the associated comment period, which ended Nov. 26, 2012.

Ohio EPA reviewed and considered all comments received during the public comment period. By law, Ohio EPA has authority to consider specific issues related to protection of the environment and public health. Often, public concerns fall outside the scope of that authority. For example, concerns about zoning issues are addressed at the local level. Ohio EPA may respond to those concerns in this document by identifying another government agency with more direct authority over the issue.

In an effort to help you review this document, the questions are grouped by topic and organized in a consistent format.

Public Hearing/Citizens' E-mails

Comment 1: ...pros and cons...concerning the landfill. It would be nice to see Miller Road paved. We have anywhere from six to ten maybe sometimes 15 days a year where if the humidity, moisture and wind are just right we have a tremendous stench that is generated by the landfill. We do have a lot of noise that comes from the landfill. The residents adjacent to the landfill should have some kind of additional benefit, if they generate enough electricity for 18,000 homes. Ultimately, what we're looking at is

property value. I don't have a problem with the expansion, but I think there should be something involved for the residents that live adjacent to that landfill.

Response 1:

The facility is required to control odors and noise from the landfill so that it does not cause a nuisance. If odors arise, the Mahoning County District Board of Health should be contacted at (330) 270-2855.

Ohio laws have not given Ohio EPA authority to consider effects a solid waste disposal facility permit may have on property values. Property values are just one of many economic issues surrounding a permit which are more appropriately handled on a local level.

Comment 2:

I am a resident of Poland Township, Ohio living not far from the Carbon Limestone Landfill. Around November 16th or 17th, we began noticing a strong odor in the air outside our house. It smelled like a mix of natural gas and garbage. On Sunday the 18th, I could smell it with the windows of my car closed turning from Rt. 170 to my house on Arrel Rd. The morning of Monday the 19th as soon as I opened the front door, my 5-year old shouted that it smelled outside. Sure enough, there was a garbage smell so strong that we waited inside the house until the school bus came. We have lived here two years and have never smelled the landfill like that. Our next-door-neighbors were so bothered by it that they called the police to report it. We are not sure why the odor was so strong, but in recent weeks, there has been a lot of work on the drilling pad for the natural gas well that is going on the landfill's land adjacent to our township park. I worry that if the landfill is permitted to expand that this odor will occur more frequently. Another concern of residents and environmental groups is that with the expansion of the landfill, they will be able to accept more of the "allowable" fracking waste from their onsite well. With all of their land, it is additionally feared that an injection well will be placed there as well, so that the brine waste will not have to be trucked offsite. I, as well as others in the area, have well water and fear for the safety of our water not only from the fracking, but from the additional garbage and waste that the landfill will be able to hold with its expansion. Please consider

the health, safety, and comfort of those living near the landfill before finalizing this expansion permit.

Response 2:

The odors identified around Nov. 16-18, 2012 were due to gas system maintenance at the landfill. Work started Friday, Nov. 16th and continued through Saturday Nov. 17th to shut down and replace the blower, which is part of the gas extraction system. Because there was minimal vacuum on the gas management system during this time, the area likely experienced an increase in landfill gas odors. In addition, gas odors may have been caused by other construction activities, including installation of horizontal connectors for new gas extraction wells. Installing horizontal connectors and other components for the gas extraction system will help to reduce odors from the landfill. The facility has updated the gas extraction system design to accommodate the expansion. Further, the facility is required to control odors generated at the landfill so that they do not cause a nuisance or public health hazard.

The landfill can accept only solid waste from oil and gas drilling and “fracking” operations. Solid waste is defined in Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) Rule 3745-27-01(S)(23).

Brine disposal, including brine disposal in injection wells, is regulated in Ohio by the Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR), pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 1509.22. ODNR Division of Oil and Gas Resources Management can be contacted at (614) 265-6922.

Solid waste landfills are required by OAC to be constructed and operated in a manner that will protect the public health, safety, and the environment. Ground water is required to be protected and monitored under the OAC regulations. The protection of ground water is achieved using the latest technology in liner systems, leachate collection, and gas extraction systems during construction. The facility is then required to monitor ground water around the perimeter of the landfill and as close as possible to the limits of waste placement to detect any ground water contamination caused by the landfill. The facility has a very extensive ground water monitoring system that consists of 72 monitoring wells. This ground water monitoring system will be adjusted for the expansion of the landfill and is projected to total 86 monitoring wells once the landfill is fully constructed in accordance with the expansion permit-to-install (PTI).

In addition to this extensive ground water monitoring system, the facility has been operating a network of quarry pumps. The purpose of these pumps is to partially dewater the uppermost aquifer system beneath the landfill, such that the ground water around the landfill will be hydraulically isolated from the surrounding aquifer. The expansion PTI contains the engineering and construction details for the development of a passive drainage system that will surround the landfill. The passive drainage system will replace the current method of dewatering the uppermost aquifer system through a network of quarry pond pumps and will hydraulically isolate the landfill from the uppermost aquifer system around the landfill. Ohio EPA has evaluated the existing and proposed ground water monitoring systems, the existing network of pumps and quarry ponds, and the proposed passive drainage system, and has determined that they will adequately protect public health, safety, and the environment.

Comment 3: I have become aware that Carbon Limestone Landfill will have a well pad(s) for fracking on their land. I object to this for safety reasons. Residential homes next door, public playground/park next door, and fracking has been proven to have high risks to the environment, health, water, air, and property values. Please take this email as a strong objection to approving fracking on this land. Thank you.

Response 3: Ohio EPA does not regulate oil and gas drilling; ODNR regulates oil and gas drilling in Ohio. ODNR Division of Oil and Gas Resources Management can be contacted at (614) 265-6922. For more information, visit their website at www.ohioshaleinfo.com and www.epa.ohio.gov/shale.asapx. The construction related to the gas drilling will not be on or near the landfill area and should not affect the waste placement area or any engineered components related to the landfill.

Comment 4: Over the years we have had to deal with truck traffic consisting not just of garbage trucks, but also of semi-trucks and dump trucks running at all hours of the day. In addition to the truck traffic, there are various days of the week when the landfill emits odors. Why is Mahoning County disproportionately bearing the burden

of the number of landfills, and why is this county now being considered to take on more waste via expansion?

Has the EPA considered the extra diesel traffic residents are exposed to due to large trucks running through the county? What about greenhouse gas emissions from the number of landfills in Mahoning County?

Then to add insult to injury to the health and property values of the residents surrounding this landfill, the landfill property will be fracked. As we understand, frack waste is classified as “residual waste” even though waste from horizontal fracking arriving in Ohio from out of state has never been tested by the ODNR. How can the EPA allow this waste to be disposed of in municipal landfills, when by all current knowledge, suggests this waste is dangerously radioactive? The residents surrounding this landfill are worried the expanding landfill is due to Ohio being the dumping ground of the fracking industry.

Will the EPA monitor ambient air near the landfill due to landfill emissions compounded by fracking air emissions? At this point, the EPA cannot allow the residents of this county, in particular the ones living close to the landfill to have further assaults on their health via landfill expansion in light of additional air emissions they will be exposed to via fracking air emissions. It is to be noted, if the landfill wanted input from residents, a letter should have been mailed to all residents surrounding the landfill, so people were adequately notified.

Response 4:

Landfill owners choose locations for landfill sites. Ohio EPA has no authority to approve or deny a permit application based on the number of facilities or the amount of landfill capacity available in an area and cannot take that into consideration when reviewing an application.

Ohio EPA does not have the authority to regulate truck traffic or take into consideration truck traffic when reviewing a PTI application. Ohio EPA does not regulate mobile source emissions. The U.S. EPA sets manufacturing standards on the emission levels for mobile sources and the local government committees take into consideration vehicle air emissions during roadway planning. The following

departments can be contacted if truck traffic is of concern: Ohio Department of Transportation, District 4 Office at (800) 603-1054; Mahoning County Sheriff's Department at (330) 480-5000; Springfield Township Police Department at (330) 542-2377; and Ohio State Highway Patrol, Canfield Post at (330) 533-6866.

Please see reply to comment No.1 relating to property value concerns. The facility is required to control odors and noise from the landfill so that it does not cause a nuisance. If odors arise, the Mahoning County District Board of Health should be contacted at (330) 270-2855. Greenhouse gas emissions from sources of biological decay are not regulated by Ohio EPA. Landfill gas generated at Carbon Limestone Landfill is collected through a series of gas extraction wells and collection lines that are routed to the engine plant to be used for fuel. The engines produce electricity for the electrical grid. Although the landfill is producing greenhouse gasses, it is estimated that 75 percent to 90 percent is being captured and routed to a beneficial use.

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 1509.22, ODNR Division of Oil and Gas Resources Management has the authority over drilling waste at the drilling site. Liquids and semi-solids from the drilling exploration and development can be solidified on the drilling site. However, authorization must be obtained from Ohio EPA to solidify liquid or semi-solid waste at a landfill. The construction related to the gas drilling will not be on or near the landfill area and should not affect the waste placement area or any engineered components related to the landfill. Additionally, the landfill facility must ensure that technically enhanced naturally occurring radioactive material (TENORM) waste streams do not exceed five picocuries per gram above background for combined radium 226 and 228. If the level of radium exceeds this requirement, the facility must contact the Ohio Department of Health (ODH), which regulates the possession, use, handling, storage and disposal of radiation sources. Additional information can be found for TENORM in OAC 3701:1-43 or you can contact ODH Bureau of Radiation Protection at (614) 644-2727.

Air emissions from the "fracking" process are not regulated by Ohio EPA. Air emissions at the landfill facility are regulated by Ohio EPA through permitting approved by Ohio EPA Division of Air Pollution Control. The facility is required

to monitor and report emissions, including daily monitoring of particulate emission from roadways and the working face to determine if dust suppressant is needed. Carbon Limestone Landfill collects landfill gas through an active extraction system sending the gas to either an onsite gas to energy plant or to the incinerator. The gas collection process is required to meet the New Source Performance Standards (NSPS).

Notification requirements for landfill facilities are stated in OAC Rule 3745-27-06(C)(10). Ohio law requires an applicant for a PTI for certain modifications to schedule and hold a public meeting to provide information, describe the application, and respond to questions or comments regarding the application. See Ohio Revised Code Section 3734.05(A)(2)(d). Public information sessions and public hearings are required to be held by Ohio EPA for certain applications proposing a new or modified landfill facility. Ohio EPA held a combined public information session and public hearing on Nov. 15, 2012.

End of Response to Comments